



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
MONITORING & EVALUATION CELL**

Subject:-

**MINUTES OF THE MID YEAR REVIEW MEETING HELD ON
01.02.2011 & 07.02.2011 UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF ACS (DEV)
IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF P&D DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT
OF SINDH, KARACHI.**

(List of participants Annexed).

The meeting started with a recitation of Holy Quran. The chair welcomed the participants and invited Director General (MEC) to brief the participants on over all position of ADP 2010-11 progress.

2. **The Director General (MEC) informed that the size of ADP 2010-11 was pitched at Rs. 115 Billion to implement 1766 schemes (1268 ongoing+ 498 new). Due to devastating floods in August & September, 2010 the size of ADP 2010-11 was revised downwards to Rs. 77 Billion to accommodate flood rehabilitation programme. Under the revised ADP highest priority is accorded to Special Projects followed by Special Packages, Roads, Education, Health, Coal & Energy, Water & Drainage and Agriculture. As informed by A.Ds through Monthly Progress Reports (MPR) the Finance Department had released Rs. 21.510 Billion upto 31.12.2010 and expenditure incurred was Rs. 9.331 Billion which is 43% of releases and 8% of the allocation whereas during the last year during same period the utilization was Rs. 11,921 Billion which was 45% of the releases.**

3. He further informed that every year on the demand of Administrative Departments new schemes were included however most of the Administrative Departments did not prepare / submit the PC-I for un-approved schemes in time and as a result 222 schemes were still un-approved as on 31.12.2010.

4. The chair took serious notice of delay in submission of PC-I of un-approved schemes and emphasized that Administrative Departments should prepare the PC-I of all the un-approved schemes and get those approved before 15.02.2011 from competent fora otherwise those would be dropped and position would be submitted to Honourable Chief Minister. He also showed his displeasure on revision of large number of schemes which shows that initially the schemes were not prepared and appraised properly and as a result some schemes had been revised 2 to 3 times which was mockery of development process. He directed the Administrative Departments to prepare schemes properly in the first instance to avoid revision of schemes.

5. The Director General (MEC) stated that although the over all utilization was satisfactory viz-a-viz releases but the quality of work being carried out in most of the cases was not upto required standards. In this regard he informed that **Extensive Field Monitoring / Inspection was being regularly carried out by the MEC, however the same was not being taken seriously by the Administrative Departments and Executing Agencies as appropriate level of representatives of Executing Agencies was not available during the field visits and Assistant Engineers / Sub-Engineers normally conducted the joint visits which showed lack of interest by the Executing Agencies. The requisite information / documents were NOT being provided to Monitoring Team prior to Field Visits and in many cases even after the visits.** Quality of works was not found as per standards in most of the cases. Test Regime was totally missing and Engineering Tests were NOT being carried out by the A/Ds and Executing Agencies. Moreover A.Ds are not responding to the observations / recommendations of Field Monitoring Reports & Compliance Reports are rarely submitted by the Administrative Departments / Executing Agencies.
6. The chair directed all the Administrative Departments to submit the “Compliance Reports” of all the Monitoring reports forwarded by M&E Cell to Administrative Departments so that the same could be verified during the subsequent visit of MEC.
7. The chair informed the forum that as per Govt. policy as well loan covenant with development partners / Donor agencies no un-approved schemes would be included in ADP 2011-12. He directed the Administrative Departments to identify and get all new schemes approved from competent forums which they planned to include in next ADP 2011-12 by 31st March, 2011. The chair also directed the Administrative Departments to immediately move the cases for extension of time for those schemes whose planned period had expired as the Finance Department would not release the funds for those schemes.
8. The chair asked Director General (MEC) to give Department wise presentation of the progress achieved upto 31.12.2010.

I&P DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 2600.220 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 1350.491 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 911.233 Million which was 67.5% of the releases.

2. Sr. Chief W&D P&D Department informed that if additional Rs. 250 Million were provided to Irrigation Sector, 30 to 40 schemes would be completed by 30.06.2011.

3. The chair reiterated that P&D Department had already directed the Administrative Departments to submit list of those schemes which could be completed by 30.06.2010 with provision of some additional funds over and above the revised allocation for consideration. He directed the Administrative Departments to expedite the matter.

POWER DEPARTMENT.

The forum was appraised by Chief Energy Section that scheme “Creation of Power Development Cell at Karachi”, approved in 2005, could not take off due to one or other reasons. The chair directed to expedite the momentum of implementation in order to achieve the envisaged objectives to tackle with the prevailing energy crisis and also to furnish item-wise details of achievements made on the scheme from the year 2005 till December 31, 2010 to this department within two weeks. In addition, Power Department may submit the revised PC-I of “Village Electrification Programme in Sindh Phase-I” after reconciliation of financial accounts with HESCO, latest by 15-02-2011. Special Secretary (S&T/R&T) viewed that Power Department should prepare PC-I of project “Village Electrification Programme in Sindh Phase-III” and submit to P&D Department prior to cut-off date of 15-02-2011 for its processing & approval by PDWP for smooth implementation of the Chief Minister’s directives upon completion of “Village Electrification Programme in Sindh Phase-II” as 660 work orders costing to Rs. 834.750 million were issued by Power Department as on December 2010 and only funds of Rs. 164.565 million would be available with HESCO for accommodating the Chief Minister’s directives. In addition, PC-I of new project namely “Electrification of Goths in Karachi Phase-II” may also be prepared & submitted to P&D Department for its processing & approval prior to 31-03-2011 in order to reflect in next year’s PSDP (2011-12) to implement the Chief Minister’s directives.

2. It was further informed by Chief Energy that consultants have not yet been hired for conducting “Feasibility Study for Identification & Establishment of Small and Mini Power Generation Units on various perennial canals, lakes and falls in Sindh”. Chair directed the Administrative Department to expedite the matter.

M&M DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 325.434 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 15.693 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 12.269 Million which was 78.2% of the releases.

2. The Secretary M&M Dev. Department informed that in ADP 2010-11 no new schemes of the Department was included. He further informed that no releases had been made by Finance Department for Revenue component for which DROs amounting to Rs. 100 Million were pending with Finance Department. The Director (MEC) P&D informed the forum that revised PC-I of the scheme at ADP Sr. No 141 was pending with SCA for the last 1 ½ year. The chair directed the Secretary Coal & Energy Department to ensure that revised PC-I is submitted to M&M Department in one week time.

COAL & ENERGY DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 3326.730 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 820.720 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 412.098 Million which was 50.2% of the releases.

2. The Secretary Coal & Energy informed that last year Rs. 317 Million were released to CAA for construction of Air Strip at Islamkot which had not been utilized. He further informed that report regarding performance of lowest bidder would be submitted to the Board of CAA in its next meeting for appropriate decision. He further informed that due to less allocation for ADP scheme No. 283 the bids has been un responsive. Regarding less utilization upto 31.12.2010 he informed that it was due to ban on incurring of expenditure imposed by Govt. in October 2010 which has been lifted in December 2010. Regarding scheme No. 285 it was informed that Mining Department Mehran University of Engineering has been contacted to establish the Center. Besides Australian Team would also send their timelines and project proposals.
3. The chair directed the Secretary Coal & Energy Department to expedite the pending issues hampering the progress.

INDUSTRIES DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 842.580 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 203.798 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 30.625 Million which was only 15% of the releases.

2. He further informed that **all the schemes of SSIC were under revision as such Finance Department had not released any funds to SSIC. The new schemes of SSIC were also un-approved. The chair showed his concern on this situation.** The Secretary Industries Department informed that due to non availability of land the new schemes for establishment of small industries at Larkana (Extension) Power Loom Hyderabad and T.M Khan had not been prepared. Regarding revision of PC-Is he informed that revised PC-Is would be submitted shortly to P&D Department.

3. **The chair directed Secretary Industries to personally contact concerned DCOs for identification of land for SIEs. For schemes No. 122 & 123 the Department would contact District Government. Thatta and submit PC-I in 15 days.**

4. Regarding setting up of Management Committees for SITE Nooriabad, Kotri and Larkana Secretary Industries informed that Presentation is to be given to Minister Industries on the concept. **The chair stated that it was a govt. decision which is to be implemented. He directed the Secretary Industries to expedite the matter.**

AGRICULTURE DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 2113.150 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 888.953 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 59.829 Million which was only 7% of the releases.

2. The chair showed concern on low utilization during the period under review.

The Secretary Agriculture informed that due to ban on expenditure the utilization was low. He assured that utilization would improve during 3rd quarter as the schemes under Agriculture Department had large Revenue Components which would be utilized.

3. The chair observed that the scheme regarding setting up of Chilli processing plant funded under Federal PSDP was not progressing well. He suggested that Agriculture

Department may look into this so that scheme could be financed by Govt. of Sindh.

4. The forum was appraised by Chief Energy that Agriculture Department had requested to provide funds under Revenue Heads instead of Capital Head as reflected in PSDP 2010-11 for the scheme "Use of Wind / Solar / Bio-gas energy for Irrigation & Agriculture Projects (Provision of Windmills for pumping of Irrigation Water, Solar Dryers for Fruits & Vegetables. Provision of Power Packs for Drip / Sprinkler Irrigation System & Seed Graders / Cleaners to the Farmers for the promotion & development of renewable Technologies in Sindh Province)" Secretary Agriculture Department committed to send the comprehensive details of requirements of funds under Revenue & Capital Heads for the project against approved cost of Rs. 286.965 million as well as monthly progress report on regular basis.

LIVE STOCK & FISHERIES DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 1900.800 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 384.169 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 34.108 Million which was 8.9% of the releases.

2. **The chair showed his concern on very low utilization by the Department.** The Secretary LS&F department informed that funds were released very late i.e in December, 2010 by Finance Department. He assured that funds will be utilized in time and they would furnish the list of scheme which would be completed by 30.06.2011 within 15 days.

ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

The Director General (MEC) informed that MPR was not submitted by the Administrative Department since July 2010 as such they were unable to analyze performance of the Department.

2. The Sr. Chief Environment informed the forum that performance of the Department was not upto mark as decisions taken at the different fora for Modifications and Revision of schemes were not implemented. Secretary Environment informed that they were adhering to the decisions however clearance of schemes was being unnecessarily delayed. The chair directed that Sr. Chief Environment to sort out all the pending issues in a meeting with Secretary Environment within one week.

3. The Secretary Environment assured to submit PC-Is of un-approved schemes by 15.02.2011. He also assured submission of MPR regularly to M&E Cell.

4. Special Secretary (S&T / R&T) highlighted that all schemes of Environment & Alternative Energy Department reflected under Energy Sector stood un-approved as modified PC-I of project "Supply & Installation of Solar Powered Water Pumping Units and Desalination Plants in Rural Areas of Sindh" was still awaited in pursuance of the PDWP'S decision taken on 28-01-2010 and Advisor to Chief Minister for P&D Department's instructions to take up the project on pilot basis. Moreover, PC-I of project viz "Wind / Solar & Waste to Energy Development in Sindh" was not prepared for generation of electricity through alternative sources like wind, solar & waste. Secretary, Environment & Alternative Energy Department showed his concern on delay in processing & approval of Environment & Alternative Energy Department's schemes. As a response Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), offered to sit with him to resolve all out standing issues causing "nil" progress. Secretary Environment & Alternative Energy Department, preferred to have a meeting first with Special Secretary (S&T/R&T) to stream-line the matters and, in case of problem, Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), would be approached.

5. The Chair directed that all the issues of Environment Department should be solved in a separate meeting by Sr. Chief Environment and SS (S&T) P&D with Secretary Environment before 15.02.2011.

Information & Technology

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 1264.583 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 215.435 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 132.539 Million which was 61.5% of the releases.

2. The representative of I.T Department informed that schemes at Sr. No. 1564 & 1565 would be completed by 30.06.2011 where as Plan period extension would be required for Schemes appearing at ADP # 1566 & 1567.

3. The Director General, MEC informed that one scheme of IT Department i.e Policing was being monitored through Third Party Consultant who was regularly submitting quarterly reports. The reports were forwarded to IT department for comments & compliance of the recommendation of the consultant. He asked representative of Information & Technology Department, if the scheme would be completed during Current Financial Year. The representative of IT Department informed that due to delay in handing over of some offices by Police Department this scheme would be stretched to next Financial Year. Director (MEC) informed that the Third Party Consultant's scope may need further extension in case the scheme continues in next financial year so as monitor the scheme till completion as envisaged in the TORs which include submission of Final Report up on completion of the scheme. He further informed that in a report for quarter July – September 2010, the Consultant had recommended use of Bar Code based cards for Driving Licence viz-a-viz chip based cards as Bar Code was cost effective. The representative of IT Department agreed with the recommendation.

SPECIAL PACKAGES.

HDP.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 1000.00 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 289.070 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 287.833 Million which was 99.6% of the releases.

2. The representative of the HDP informed that Finance Department was not releasing funds for the schemes namely “Constt: of Flyover at Latif Chowk Hyderabad” as according to them cost is more than 15% permissible limit where as it was actually 13% above the approved cost. The chair directed the representative of Finance Department to look into this and resolve it expeditiously

KARACHI PACKAGE.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 2000.00 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 393.461 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 51.414 Million which was only 15.9% of the releases.

2. The representative of CDGK informed that 11 schemes under the Package had been cleared by T.C and would be considered by PDWP. Regarding 03 schemes Summaries had been submitted to Chief Minister outcome of which was awaited.

LYARI, MALIR & KIAMARI PACKAGE.

3. It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 1600 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 537.632 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 141.665 Million which was 26.35% of the releases.

4. The Project Director informed that schemes under Malir, Kiamari and Karachi Rural Packages had been approved where as PC-I for Karachi East, Karachi Centre and Mubarak Village Package was pending consideration by PDWP.

5. The chair directed that processing of the PC-Is may be expedited.

S.B.A Package.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 2000 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 1384.581 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 166.324 Million which was 12% of the releases.

2.. The DCO SBA informed that Administrative Approval for authentication had been submitted to Finance Department for New Schemes under the Package. He further informed that works were under progress on on-going schemes.

SPECIAL PROJECTS OF KHAIRPUR

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that District Govt. Khairpur was not submitting MPPRs since July 2010 as such they were not able to analyze performance. The chair showed his displeasure on this.

2. The DCO Khairpur informed that out of 11 on-going schemes, 10 would be completed by 30-6-2011 where as 14 new schemes had been cleared by Technical Committee with certain observations which were being looked into. The chair stated that against the revised allocation of Rs.1200 million schemes costing Rs.3000 million had been approved. He directed DCO Khairpur to submit a Summary through LG Department for approval of schemes by Chief Minister, so that balance funding arrangement could be decided.

PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP & SPECIAL INITIATIVES UNIT.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs.3265.000 million, the Finance Department had not release any funds.

Sindh Indigenous Traditional Crafts Company (SITCO)

Mr. A. Hamneed Akhund, Secretary SITCO informed that the PC-I of the SITCO was approved during 2009-10 at the cost of Rs.800 million. Accordingly, the scheme was to be completed by 30-6-2011. However Rs.200 million had been released upto 30-6-2010 out of which Rs. 180 Million were deposited in Endowment Fund. Moreover, during Current Financial Year, Rs.50 million were allocated which had been further downsized to Rs.5 million which had put the future of company at stake. He further informed that they had identified and listed 3000 Craftsman in flood affected areas and they requested Rs.12 million for their rehabilitation. Another initiative of the company was that they had acquired 05 acres of land @Miami Forest for cultivation of indigo which was used for Ajrak industry. They are also acquiring Ceramic Institute at Nasarpur to restore it. He requested for enhancement of allocation and early release of funds.

2. The chair directed SS(D) to consider enhancement of allocations for SITCO.

Sindh Development Fund(SDF)

The representative of SDF informed that the PC-I of Sindh Development Fund was approved in 2008-09 at the cost of Rs.2.4 billion. He further informed that Sindh Development Fund (SDF) is a \$30 Million project with the focus to transform agriculture business in Sindh. It is funded by Government of Sindh and is managed by Competitiveness Support Fund (CSF) which is a joint initiative of the Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan, and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) established to reposition the Pakistan's Economy on a more global competitive footing. Upto June, 2010 an amount of Rs.740 million has been released for SDF by Govt. of Sindh. However, due to delay in registration of the company they were unable to achieve the targets as per action plan, but the strawberry and dates project at Khairpur is one of their achievements. Lastly company has been registered and pace of work would pick up. The Chair directed that general public was unaware of SDF functions as such they cannot utilize the facilities offered by SDF. He advised SDF to disseminate information through local language print and electronic media.

Union Council Based Poverty Reduction Program(UCBPRP)

It was informed by Coordinator UCBPRP that contract for award of work in 02 districts i.e. Tharparkar and Jacobabad was signed during 2009-10 and funds were released and Rs.625 million had been utilized. During current year Rs.500 million were allocated for New Schemes for which Summary is to be moved for identification of the Districts. The Chair desired that summary for Chief Minister should be submitted expeditiously.

Community Development Program(CDP).

Project Coordinator, CDP informed that Civil Society Organizations/Corporate Sector has been playing a significant role towards community development by improving the quality of peoples' life through their learned experience in the field. Focusing on this concept, a scheme namely "Community Development Program through Civil Society Organizations and Others, including Corporate Sector" was evolved in Planning and Development Department, Government of Sindh which is under execution presently. In the first phase, 27 credible CSOs have been extended financial assistance to the tune of Rs.249 million under this program to broaden and extend their community development activities. 09 more reliable CSOs have also been extended financial assistance to the tune of Rs.304 million in the second phase for bring change in the lives of the people by creating income generation activities.

2. He further informed that Community Development Program was approved by PDDWP in its meeting held on 30th September, 2008 at the cost of Rs. 500 million. Keeping in view the success of the program the estimated cost of CDP was enhanced to Rs. 622.800 million as per revised PC-1 in January, 2010. The Program is being implemented under direct supervision of a high powered Community Development Board chaired by Dr. Shamsah Kassim Lakha with major representation from private sector.

3. As per the scope and mandate of the program, those CSOs are extended partnerships which have specialization in the thematic sectors of the program i.e. Education, Health, Water & Sanitation, Women empowerment, Skill Development and Legal Aid. A merit base and transparent procedure is adopted in implementing the program.

4. Recently, USAID through KPMG which is one of the four top of the world CPA Firms, made evaluation and assessment of Govt. Departments and various Projects working under the Govt. They have ranked CDP as one of the best managed program of Govt. of Sindh.

5. The Community Development Board has held ten (10) Board meetings during last one year. The Board has played very proactive role to assist Govt. Of Sindh in addressing the issues of poverty and lately of the flood ravaged people. Recently, the Board initiated the provision of clean drinking water to flood affected people through renowned CSOs. As of today around 1.2 million people are getting clean drinking water every day.

6. After the constitution of the Community Development Board the program got more importance and impetus from the executive corners including the Chief Minister Sindh and the Advisor to Chief Minister Sindh for P&DD. Subsequent to the constitution of new Board and the confidence of the Government in the transparent functioning of the program, the Cabinet approved enhancement of the allocation for the program. Thus, the annual budget approved by Sindh Assembly has reflected the increased allocation of CDP @Rs.500 million. As the scheme is being re-revised the funds for the current year have not been released.

7. The chair directed that revised PC-1 be submitted before 15-2-2011 for consideration of TCM and subsequent approval by PDDWP forum.

L.G DEPARTMENT.

(a) KW&SB

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 187.583 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 105.938 Million which had been fully utilized by the Department.

2. The chair observed that recovery position of KW&SB was very poor which should be improved. The Development partners had also shown their concern on low recovery.

(b) Special Projects:

3. It was informed by Director (MEC) that MPR of 03 schemes pertaining to TMAs of Sukkur, Mirpurkhas and Latifabad were not being received regularly. The chair directed the representative of Local Govt. Department to review the progress of all the Special Projects under Local Govt. Department and ensure timely submission of MPR regularly.

RURAL DEVELOPMENT.

4. It was informed by Director General (MEC) that all the schemes were unapproved. The chair showed his concern and directed to get the PC-Is approved by 12-02-2011 positively.

TRANSPORT DEPARTMENT.

It was informed that against the Revised allocation of Rs. 130 Million funds to the tune of Rs.29.336 Million was released against which nil expenditure was reported. The chair showed his displeasure on dismal performance.

2. The representative of Transport Department informed that W&S Department had prepared the Rough Cost Estimates in respect of scheme at Sr. No. 658. He further informed that 01 scheme was to be considered by Technical Committee in the forthcoming meeting.
3. The chair directed Chief Engineer Buildings Department to expedite the preparation of Rough Cost Estimates for scheme No. 658. The Administrative Department was directed to ensure approval of pending schemes latest by 20.02.2011.

INVESTMENT DEPARTMENT.

The Secretary Investment Department informed that 03 PC-I had been modified in light of Technical Committee observations where as 01 PC-I was under preparation and would be submitted before 15.02.2011.

CULTURE DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 361.702 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 67.636 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 23.146 Million which was 34% of the releases.

2. The Secretary Culture Department informed that out of 06 un-approved schemes, 02 has been approved by DDWP. He assured that PC-Is of remaining 04 schemes would be submitted by 16.02.2011.

3. The Director MEC raised the issue of 02 schemes at ADP Sr. No. 1467 & 1468 on which the work is held up for the last 04 years. The Secretary Antiquities informed the forum that a Committee was constituted by Govt. of Sindh to prepare Master Plan for conservation of Rani Kot Fort of which he was also the member. EOI was published in newspaper in response certain firms submitted their proposals. He suggested that meeting of the committee may be called early by Culture Department to finalize the proposal for Master Plan. Regarding Kotdiji Fort he informed that the work was stopped by His Highness Prince Mahdi as it was felt to be not according to required standards and specifications. However, lately the Prince has consented for the restoration work. The chair directed that Culture Department should hold a meeting of the committee at the earliest and also include Prince Mahdi in the committee for Kotdiji.

AUOAF DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 216.828 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 48.328 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 30.691 Million which was 63.5% of the releases.

2. Special Secretary Augaf Department informed that one un-approved scheme at Sr. No. 1531 would be carried forward to 2011-12 and they would get it considered / approved by 30.03.2011. Regarding other un-approved scheme it was informed that PC-I would be submitted by 20.02.2011 after the visit of shrine of Abdullah Shah Gazi by Secretary Augaf. It was further informed that 08 schemes requires extension in Plan period for which they had already submitted the request to P&D Department.

3. Regarding scheme No. 1523 it was informed that consultant had been directed to identify the issues and there after meeting would be held with Antiquities Department to resolve the issues. Scheme at Sr. No. 1525 would be completed by 30.06.2011 whereas the Department would take final decision regarding continuing or otherwise on scheme No. 1527.

ANTIQUITIES.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 388.000 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 94.066 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 1.483 Million which was 1.6% of the releases and on very low side.

2. The Secretary Antiquities Department informed that consultations had been completed with all stakeholders in respect of "Conservation of Hyderabad Fort" and report submitted to P&D. However P&D wanted more consultation on the issue. The chair desired that the scheme may be considered in next Technical Committee.

3. On slow utilization of funds he informed that due to peculiar nature of conservation works it usually take longer time for completion. He further informed that Summary for C.M has been submitted for scheme at Sr. No. 1646 and 1647 as their cost was more than Rs. 100 Million. Regarding submission of compliance report on the Monitoring report by MEC, he requested that the Monitoring Report may be forwarded again.

EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 4560.500 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 2178.313 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 1256.962 Million which was 57.7% of the releases.

2. The Secretary, Education Department informed the forum that they were reviewing the whole Portfolio of the Department in order to streamline the same and also review the cost downwards and would submit by 20.02.2010. She further informed that they plan to drop all the 23 new college schemes. She further also informed that they may drop all the schemes of teacher training as the same were also being done through CIDA grant.

LABOUR DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 128.696 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 40.000 Million against which utilization was nil which indicated a dismal position of development.

2. The representative of Labour Department informed that 02 un-approved schemes would be considered by 20.02.2011 and one PC-I would be submitted by 20.02.2011 for consideration of PDWP. Two schemes at Sr. No. 1506 & 1507 would be completed by 30.06.2011 where as summary for Chief Minister had been moved for scheme at Sr. No. 1508.

INFORMATION ARCHIVES DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that Administrative Department had not submitted the MPR since July 2011 as such they can not comment on progress. The representative of Archives Department informed that revised scheme for e-archives had been approved by DDWP where as Modified PC-1 of other schemes would be submitted on 08.02.2010. The representative of Information Department informed that PC-1 of the one scheme at Sr. No. 1515 was considered by T.C in December 2009.

STEVTA

The representative of STEVTA informed that PC-I of the scheme was considered

by T.C on 30.11.2011 and Modified PC-I would be submitted in one week time.

LAW DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 249.932 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 186.145 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 69.816 Million which was 37.5% of the releases.

2. The Chief Engineer Buildings Department informed that Summary for Chief Minister has been moved for schemes at Sr. No. 346, 347, 349 & 350 as their revised cost was more than Rs. 100 Million. Chair directed to expedite the Summary.

3. The representative of Law Department informed that due to non availability of plots 03 schemes at ADP Sr. No. 340, 358 & 361 were still un-approved. Chair advised to put serious efforts for acquiring appropriate plots so that schemes could take off during Current

Financial Year

SPORTS AND YOUTH AFFAIRS DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 365.600 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 92.175 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 33.458 Million which was 36.3% of the releases. Director (MEC) informed that MPRs of Youth Affairs were not being submitted.

2. The Secretary Sports and Youth affairs assured that henceforth MPRs would be furnished regularly. He informed that out of 14 un-approved schemes 11 had been approved where as PC-Is of 02 schemes would be considered in forthcoming T.C.M in which he himself would like to defend the schemes on merit. The PC-I of remaining one scheme was under preparation and would be expedited. He assured that all the PC-Is would be approved before 20.02.2011. The chair appreciated efforts made by the Secretary to activate the Department and assured him that if additional funds were required to complete the schemes during Current Financial Year same would be considered by P&D Department.

TOURISM

The representative of the Department informed that as the Department was newly created and facing certain capacity problems as such no funds could be got released. He further informed that the Department will prioritize the schemes which would be submitted within one week. The chair directed that all the un-approved schemes should be prioritized and got approved by 20.02.2011.

SOCIAL WELFARE DEPARTMENT.

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 140.169 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 29.797 Million against which the utilization was nil as per Progress Report received from Buildings Department. He stated that MPRs were not being furnished by the Department.

2. The representative of the Administrative Department informed that due to non-availability of Secretary 03 schemes remained un-approved where as one revised scheme at Sr. No. 1556 would be considered in next Technical Committee. They would shortly submit request for Plan Period extension for one scheme at Sr. No. 1555.

WOMEN DEVELOPMENT.

It was informed that against the revised allocation of Rs. 270.843 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 50.366 Million against which the Department had utilized only Rs. 5.950 Million which was 11.8% of the releases.

2. The representative of Administrative Department informed that 02 schemes at Sr. No. 1584 & 1588 would be completed by 30.06.2011. It was further informed that scheme at Sr. No. 1589 would be revised and plan period extension was required for scheme at Sr. No. 1590. Buildings has been hired for scheme at Sr. No. 1592 and Summary for appointment of staff has been moved for scheme at Sr. No. 1593. The chair directed to expedite all the pending actions including approval of schemes shall be ensured by 20.02.2011.

HEALTH DEPARTMENT

It was informed by Director (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 4095.00 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 1068.594 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 503.180 Million which was 47.6% of the releases

2. The representative of Health Department informed that out of 28 un-approved, 08 schemes were considered by Technical Committee and their PC-Is were under modification, 02 schemes were under process in P&D, whereas PC-I of 06 schemes were under finalization would be submitted to P&D before 20.02.2011. The PC-Is of 12 schemes were not yet prepared and were being expedited. The chair showed displeasure on slow process and directed that all the un-approved schemes should be got approved before 20.02.2011.

3. The representative of Administrative Department further informed that last year i.e 2009-10, Rs. 1052 Million liability of 26 schemes was to be cleared for which they had moved a Summary for funding through out-side budget. It was further informed that they had not yet submitted the DROs of 22 approved schemes amounting to Rs. 725 Million as re-appropriation would be requested if out-side budget sanction for 26 schemes mentioned above was not approved. It was also informed that Finance Department had not yet accorded permission for SDA Account as such capital side expenditure was on lower side.

4. On a query regarding nil release for Nutrition Sub-Sector, it was informed that PC-I was under preparation in consultation with the World Bank.

5. The chair directed that Health Department to expedite all the pending actions at the earliest so that funds were judiciously utilized.

POLICE.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 163.57 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 130.963 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 65.116 Million which was 67% of the releases.

2. It was informed by Secretary Home Department that un-approved schemes had been put into the category of delayed schemes in revised ADP 2010-11. The chair directed that these schemes should be got approved before 30 March 2011 for reflecting the schemes in next year's ADP with approved status.

SG&CD.

It was informed that against the Revised Allocation of Rs.240.181 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 52.00 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 18.794 Million which was 36% of the releases.

2. The Secretary GA informed that they would require additional Rs. 50 Million for scheme at Sr. No. 382. Regarding Sindh House at Gowadar it was informed that size of the plot is small and Govt. of Balouchistan has been requested to allot larger size plot. He further informed that the Chief Minister has decided to drop the scheme of “Additional Suit at Circuit House Hyderabad”. He opined that in view of condition of the existing Old Circuit house it would be renovated either through M&R or if need be, a development scheme would be prepared. The Chief Engineer Buildings assured that revised PC-I for Renovation of AS/DS flats would be submitted within one week. The chair showed his concern on low utilization of funds and directed to accelerate development works and allocated funds should be judicially utilized.

BUILDINGS.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 58.890 Million the Finance Department had released Rs. 27.500 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 19.078 Million which was 69.4% of the releases. He stressed that quality of construction needs to be improved by strictly following standards and specifications. Test regime was generally missing and cube / cylinder Tests shall be made regular feature. The quality of shuttering and use of proper spacer blocks and placement of reinforcement steel in structural members of the buildings needs special attention.

2. The Chief Engineer Buildings informed that a Summary for Chief Minister has been moved for scheme at Sr. No. 366. He further informed that Banquet Hall at Chief Minister House will be completed by 30.06.2011 where as scope for new scheme for Chief Minister Secretariat is still awaited.

ROADS.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 8270 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 4474.206 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 2756.006 Million which was 61.6% of the releases.

2. Director General (MEC) further stated that although utilization of funds was satisfactory but the quality of works needs to be improved. The test regime was totally missing and the engineering tests, shall be carried out at all the stages of construction including soil classification tests, use of Optional Moisture Content, proper compaction of earth works followed by specified compaction Tests. Stones used in road construction should be crushed to the specified maximum size and proper "gradation" was must to avoid voids for ensuring proper compaction. TST and carpeting specifications shall be strictly followed alongwith maintaining proper Camber and shoulder slopes. Secretary Works & Services assured that quality of work would be maintained. The Chief Engineer Highways assured to adopt standards specifications and test regime in the highway construction works.

3. He informed that Summary for Chief Minister has been moved for change of nomenclature of 11 schemes where as 16 un-approved schemes were under process with P&D. The chair stressed on cooperation of Administrative Department to the Monitoring Teams of MEC and for providing requisite information before field visits and subsequent submission of compliance reports on the monitoring reports prepared by MEC P&D Department. The Secretary Works & Services assured that in future concerned XENs would accompany the monitoring team of P&D and compliance report would also be submitted.

PROVINCIAL OMBUDSMAN.

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 22.500 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 22.500 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 3.605 Million which was 16% of the releases.

2. The representative of Administrative Department informed that plot allotted in Mirpurkhas has been taken back by DCO where as no plot was available in Sukkur. Superintending Engineer Buildings (Karachi) proposed that in case Govt land was not available, private land could be purchased for the purpose. The representative of Provincial Ombudsman promised to look into the proposal. For Sukkur office, he proposed that possibility of acquiring plot in Khaipur would be considered. For Larkana, existing office would be dismantled for const. of new office whereas work was in progress at Shaheed Benazirabad. The chair directed that District Governments Sukkur and Mirpurkhas should be approached for expeditiously arranging suitable plots else the alternatives as proposed should be considered. Building Department was asked to assist in identification of plots.

PHED

It was informed by Director General (MEC) that against the revised allocation of Rs. 1423.426 Million, the Finance Department had released Rs. 953.883 Million against which the Department had utilized Rs. 591.437 Million which was 62% of the releases.

2. The Chief Engineer PHED informed that 15 schemes had been approved by DDWP where as PC-Is of W/S schemes of Thul & Janshoro would be submitted next week to P&D. He further informed that scheme for Constt: of Tanks in Arid Areas may be dropped as it was not feasible. He expressed that similar Tanks in Rahimyar Khan was also not a success story. On pointation by Director General (MEC) regarding findings of Monitoring Teams during their field visits, the Secretary PHED assured that compliance reports on monitoring reports would be submitted. The Director General (MEC) stressed on use of proper sand blasting of steel pipes and deployment of qualified welders and adoption of X-ray tests. Proper Coating of steel pipes and their handling was also stressed by Director General (MEC). Administrative Departments was also asked to avoid storage of pipes in open environment which was causing rusting of steel pipes.

GENERAL DECISIONS:

- i) PC-Is of un-approved projects reflected in PSDP 2010-11 should be got approved from the competent fora by the cut off date i.e 15.02.2011, so that allocated funds could be released by Finance Department to initiate work on the project during current financial year.
- ii) In case of schemes / projects which needs revision the PC-I of revised project should be submitted for getting approval of competent fora by 15.02.2011 so that Finance Department could release the funds for their smooth implementation.
- iii) Administrative Departments to submit by 15.02.2011 for extension in time those schemes to P&D where Plan period had expired.
- iv) Only approved projects will be reflected in next year's PSDP (i.e 2011-12). All Administrative Departments should identify and prepare the PC-Is of the New schemes and get approval of the competent forum by 31.03.2011 for inclusion of the new projects in PSDP 2011-12.
- v) Administrative Departments to expeditiously submit list of those schemes which require additional funds for their completion during Current Financial Year.
- vi) Concerned XEN's to accompany monitoring teams of M&E Cell P&D during visits field. The requisite information as per prescribed proforma circulated by MEC shall be furnished before the field visits to facilitate meaning-full discussion during the joint visits.
- vii) Administrative Departments to submit compliance reports of Field Monitoring reports forwarded by M&E Cell, within the time specified in the Reports so that verification field visits, if necessary, could be carried out.
- viii) Test Regime in Engineering works should be ensured as specified in the Contract Documents / Agreements. Special attention needs to be paid for compaction of earth work in layers (verified by field density tests), crushing of stone to the required size / gradation for sub-base & base courses, maintaining proper Camber and slope of berms, proper TST & carpeting and adequate cross – drainage etc. Cube / Cylinder Concrete Tests through specified laboratories was must and so was the use of spacer blocks and proper vibration of concrete in structural members of buildings to avoid bleeding or honey combing etc.
- ix) Administrative Departments to closely monitor construction works at every level of engineering staff and to hold monthly review meetings of their Development Portfolio.
- x) Coal & Energy Department to submit revised PC-I of the scheme at Sr. No. 141 to M&M Department in one weeks time.
- xi) Industries Department to contact District govt. Thatta and submit PC-Is in 15 days for schemes at Sr. No. 122 & 123.
- xii) Industries Department to resolve the issue of Management Committees for SITE Nooriabad, Kotri and Larkana within 15 days.
- xiii) Environment Department to resolve all outstanding issues in a meeting with Special Secretary (S&T) P&D and Sr. Chief Environment P&D within 15 days.
- xiv) DCO Khairpur to submit Summary for Chief Minister through Local Govt. Department for approval of schemes under Special Projects of Khairpur.
- xv) Special Secretary (Dev) P&D to submit a case for increase in allocation of SITCO.
- xvi) SDF to disseminate information regarding their role and activities through local language print and electronic Media.
- xvii) Coordinator UCBBRP to expeditiously move a Summary for Chief Minister for identification of the District to be taken under new schemes.
- xviii) Culture Department to convene meeting of the Committee constituted to finalize the Master Plan for preservation / conservation of Rani Kot within 15 days.



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
MONITORING & EVALUATION CELL**

Dated 1st & 7th February, 2011

List of participants

| Sr. No. | Name & Designation | In chair |
|---|------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Planning & Dev. Department. | | |
| 1. | Mr. Muhammad Ishaque Lashari | ACS (Dev) |
| 2. | Mr. Abdul Raufique Laghari | Director General, MEC, |
| 3. | Mr. P.S. Rajani | Special Secretary (Tech) |
| 4. | Dr. Noor-ul-Haq | Special Secretary (Dev) |
| 5. | Mr. Khalid Waheed | Special Secretary (S&T) |
| 6. | Mr. Fazal A. Nizamani | Sr. Chief (Water) P&D |
| 7. | Mr. Inayatullah Qureshi | Director, MEC |
| 8. | Mr. Mehtab-ul-Haq | Chief (Industries) |
| 9. | Mr. Bisharat A. Channa | Chief (T&C) |
| 10. | Mr. Khalid Mahmood Siddiqui | Chief (PP&H) |
| 11. | Mr. Faheem Akhtar | Chief (Edu) : |
| 12. | Mr. Shahabudin | Chief (Agri & LS&F) |
| 13. | Mr. Fauzullah Khatiri | Chief, Energy |
| 14. | Mrs. Saeeda Rasheed | Chief SAZDA/R.D. |
| 15. | Dr. Shereen Mustafa | PC, SGRPP |
| 16. | Mr. M. H. Zaman | System Analysis MEC, P&D |
| 17. | Dr. Javed Khawaja | SMO, MEC |
| 18. | Dr. Shehla Khan | Assistant Chief (S.Sector) |
| 19. | Mrs. Shahnaz Siddiqui | Assistant Chief (Health) |
| 20. | Mr. M. Adnan Nazir | Assistant Chief (PP&H) |
| 21. | Mr. Piaro Khan Naich | Assistant Chief (Edu) |
| 22. | Mr. Ghulam Murtaza Abro | Assistant Chief (Water)P&D |
| 23. | Mr. Saleem Jalbani | Assistant Chief (Environment)P&D |
| 24. | Mr. Zeeshan Inam | Planning Officer Agri |
| 25. | Mr. M. Nasir Khan | S.O. (EPR), P&D |
| Coastal Dev. Authority P&D | | |
| 26. | Mr. Mohsin Chandna | DG, SCDA |
| Works & Services Department. | | |
| 27. | Mr. Rasool Bux Phulpoto | Secretary (W&S) |
| 28. | Mr. Nazir Ahmed Shaikh | Additional Secretary W&S |
| 29. | Syed Jainsar Ali Shah | Chief Engineer (Building) Hyd. |
| 30. | Syed Abdul Qadir Shah | Chief Engineer Highways Hyderabad |
| 31. | Mr. Ghulam Qadir Laghari | S.E. Provincial Building Karachi |

| | | |
|-----|---|--|
| | Bureau of Statistics | |
| 32. | Mr. Manzoor Ahmed Memon | Director, BOS |
| | SGA&C Department. | |
| 33. | Mr. Muhammad Waseem | Secretary, GA |
| 34. | Mr. Abdul Waheed Khan | Deputy Director (Dev) SGA&CD |
| | Home Department | |
| 35. | Mr. Arif Ahmed Khan | Home Secretary |
| 36. | Mr. Aftab Ahmed Soomro | Project Director |
| | Provincial Ombudsman | |
| 37. | Mr. S. Amir Ali Shah | DG, P.O.S |
| 38. | Mr. Afzal Ahmed | Director (Finance) |
| | Excise & Taxation Department | |
| 39. | Mr. Aftab Alam | Deputy Secretary (T) |
| | Education Department | |
| 40. | Mrs. Naeed S. Durani | Secretary Education. |
| 41. | Mr. Ashfaqe Ahmed Qadri | Additional Secretary PDF, |
| 42. | Mr. G. Mahdi Balouch | Director, |
| | Culture Department | |
| 43. | Mr. Alam Din Bullo | Secretary, Culture |
| 44. | Mr. Shahzor Ali Tabani | Director, . |
| | Tourism Department | |
| 45. | Mr. Wali Muhammad Qureshi | Deputy Secretary, Tourism Deptt. |
| | Labour Department. | |
| 46. | Mr. Naveed Ahmed | Additional Secretary, Labour |
| 47. | Mr. M. Asif Siddiqui | Project Director (Manpower & Training) |
| | Law Department. | |
| 48. | Mr. Gul Hassan Memon | Deputy Secretary, Law |
| | Augaf Department | |
| 49. | Ms. Rehana G. Ali Memon | Special Secretary, Zakat Ushr & Augaf |
| 50. | Mr. S. Barkat A. Rizvi | Chief Administrator, Augaf Sindh |
| | Information & Archives Department. | |
| 51. | Mr. Iqbal Nafees Khan | Special Secretary (Archives) |
| 52. | Mr. Tariq Hussain Khero | Director Information Karachi. |
| | Antiquities Department. | |
| 53. | Dr. Kaleemullah Lashari | Secretary, Antiquities |
| | Women Department. | |
| 54. | Mr. Nawaz Naseem | Additional Secretary |
| 55. | Ms. Musrat Jabeen | Deputy Secretary, |
| | Public Health Engineering Department. | |
| 56. | Mr. S.A. Kaleem Malki | Secretary, PHE |
| 57. | MR. Shabeer Ahmed Bhurgri | Chief Engineer, PHE |
| | Social Welfare Department. | |
| 58. | Ms. Mariam Ibrahim | Deputy Secretary, Social Welfare |
| 59. | Syed Siraj Uddin | Planning Officer Social Welfare Deptt. |
| 60. | Mrs. Surriyar Waheed | Deputy Director PMC & SWD |

| STEVTA | | |
|---|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 61. | Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Joyo | Director (W/S) STEVTA |
| 62. | Mr. Abdul Jabbar | Deputy Director (Dev) STEVTA |
| Sports & Youth Affairs Department. | | Secretary |
| 63. | Mr. Shoaib Ahmed Siddiqui | Deputy Secretary Youth Affairs Deptt; |
| 64. | Mr. M. Hanif Mirchiwala | |
| Irrigation & Power Department. | | |
| 65. | Rafique Ali Memon | Secretary, I&P |
| 66. | Mr. Mohammad Qasim Chang | SO (P&D) I&P |
| Power Department | | |
| 67. | Mr. Saeed Ahmed Sethar | Additional Secretary (Power) |
| Mines & Mineral Dev. Deptt: | | |
| 68. | Mr. Allah Dito Shar | Secretary Mines & Mineral |
| 69. | Mr. Abdul Ghani Jokhio | DG, M&M Deptt. |
| 70. | Mr. Muhammad Khalid | CIM, M&M Deptt. |
| 71. | Mr. Ahmed Mangi | Director Exploration M&MD |
| Industries Department. | | |
| 72. | Mr. Zamir Ahmed Khan | Secretary Industries & Commerce. |
| 73. | Mr. Abdul Rashid Solangi | MD, SITE |
| 74. | Mr. Mushtaq Ali Lighari | DMD SSIC |
| Coal & Energy Department. | | |
| 75. | Mr. Aijaz Ali Khan | Secretary Coal & Energy |
| Finance Department | | |
| 76. | Mr. Asif Ikram | DS, Finance |
| Livestock & Fisheries | | |
| 77. | Dr. Laiq Ahmed | Secretary Livestock & Fisheries |
| 78. | Mr. Abdul Waheed | Deputy Secretary (Tech) LS&F |
| 79. | Mr. M. Feroz Alam | Deputy Secretary (Admn) LS&F |
| Information & Technology Dept. | | |
| 80. | Mr. Athar Hussain | PD, e-Police IT Department |
| Environment & Alternate Energy Dept. | | |
| 81. | Mir Hussain Ali | Secretary Envr. & Alternate Energy |
| 82. | Mr. Naeem Ahmed Mughal | DG, EPA, Sindh |
| 83. | Mr. Waqar Hussain | Director, EPA, Sindh |
| Hyderabad Dev. Package | | |
| 84. | Mr. A. Haleem Ghori | D.P.D,HDP, Hyderabad |
| 85. | Mr. S. Shahzad | A.O, HDP |
| District Govt. Khairpur | | |
| 86. | Mr. Muhammad Abbas Baloch | DCO, Khairpur |

| | |
|---|---|
| Malir, Keamari & Karachi Rural Package | |
| 87. Mr. M. Siddique Jalalani | PD, Malir Kiamari & Karachi Rural |
| District Govt. Shahheed Benazirabad | |
| 88. Mr. Jamal Mustafa Syed | DCO, SBA |
| 89. Mr. Pheru Mal Rohra | EDO (W&S) SBA |
| Local Govt. Department. | |
| 90. Mr. M. Usman Panhwar | Special Secretary |
| KW&SB | |
| 91. Mr. Ghulam Qadir | C.E. KW&SB |
| 92. Mr. M. Ovais Malik | CE, Zone B KW&SB |
| 93. Mr. A. Ghafar Shaikh | S.E. Janshed Town KW&SB |
| 94. Mr. Ansar Ahmed | S.E. Saddar Town KW&SB |
| 95. Mr. M. Riaz Khan Ghori | S.E, Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town KW&SB |
| 96. Mr. Shahid Ali | SE Kiamari Town KW&SB |
| 97. Mr. Imran Zaidi | Deputy Director (Accounts) / KW&SB |
| City District Govt. Karachi. | |
| 98. Mr. Nayab Saeed Khan | DO Accounts W&S, CDGK |
| SEDF | |
| 99. Mr. Salahuddin Mirza | Assistant Manager SEDF |
| 100. Mr. M. Nabil Mustafa | A. Accounts Manager (SEDF) |
| Transport Department | |
| 101. Mr. Yar Muhammad | Project Manager Transport |
| 102. Mr. Ahsanullah Baloch | S.O, Transport |
| Food Department. | |
| 103. Dr. Azeem ur Rahim Khan | Additional Secretary (Food) |
| Rural Development Department. | |
| 104. Mr. Najeeb Ahmed Shaikh | DS. Tech. Rural Dev. Dept |
| 105. Syed Ali Farnam | District Officer (Tech) Rural Dev. Deptt. |
| <u>Agriculture Department</u> | |
| 106. Agha Jan Akhtar | Secretary |



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
MONITORING & EVALUATION CELL**

Dated 21st February, 2011

List of participants

| S.NO | Name & Designation | In chair |
|------|---|--|
| | Planning & Dev. Department. | |
| 1. | Mr. Mohammad Ismail Dahri, | Special Assistant to C.M Sindh |
| 2. | Mr. Muhammad Ishaque Lashari | ACS (Dev) |
| 3. | Mr. P.S. Rajani | |
| 4. | Dr. Noor-ul-Haq | Special Secretary (Tech) |
| 5. | Mr. Khalid Waheed | Special Secretary (Dev) |
| 6. | Mr. Inayatullah Qureshi | Special Secretary (S&T) |
| 7. | Mr. Fazal A. Nizamani | Director (MEC) |
| 8. | Mr. Mehtab-ul-Haq | Sr. Chief (Water) P&D |
| 9. | Mr. Bisharat A. Channa | Chief (Industries) |
| 10. | Dr. Fawad Shaikh | Chief (T&C) |
| 11. | Mr. Khalid Mahmood Siddiqui | Chief (Health) |
| 12. | Mr. Shahbuddin Memon | Chief (PP&H) |
| 13. | Mrs. Shahmaz Siddiqui | Chief (A &LP) |
| 14. | Dr. Shehle Khan | Assistant Chief (Health) |
| 15. | Mr. Ghulam Ali Rajper | Assistant Chief (S.Sector) |
| 16. | Mr. Gulam Khan Khaskhelly | Deputy Director (MEC) |
| | Livestock & Fisheries | Assistant Director (MEC) |
| 17. | Dr. Munawar Ahmed | |
| | Local Government | Livestock & Fisheries |
| 18. | Mr. M. Usman Panhwar | Special Secretary (LGD). |
| | District Government Sanghar | |
| 19. | Mr. Ahmed Bux Khokhar | DCO Sanghar |
| | C&W Department. | |
| 20. | Mr. Nazir Ahmed Shaikh | Additional Secretary (W&S) |
| | Health Department. | |
| 21. | Shahista Mubarak | Additional Director (Dev) |
| | Chief Minister Sindh | |
| 22. | Mr. Imdad Ali Soomro | Deputy Secretary to Chief Minister Secretariat |
| | District Government Shaheed Benazeerabad | |
| 23. | Mr. Reru Mal Rohra | EDO (W&S) SBA |